

1 **Proposed Resolution**

2 **Final Proposed Draft Submitted September 24, 2024**

3
4 **Submitted by:**

5 **Tamara Afifi, University of California, Santa Barbara**

6 **Walid Afifi, University of California, Santa Barbara**

7 **Jonathan Carter, Georgia Southwestern State University**

8 **Jamie Downing, Georgia College & State University**

9 **Shaunak Sastry, University of Cincinnati**

10
11 **Resolution Denouncing the Dehumanization of Palestinians and its Impacts**

12
13 Whereas, NCA's Strategic Plan begins with the goal of "Creat[ing] conditions to support and empower members," states
14 "Promot[ing] communication's value" as the second goal, and "Embrac[ing] and enact[ing] inclusivity, diversity, equity,
15 and access" as the third goal,

16
17 Whereas, in 2022 NCA's Legislative Assembly unanimously endorsed an Inclusion, Diversity, Equity, and Access (IDEA)
18 Strategic Plan¹, led by the IDEA Task Force, which situates its purpose within "an organizational desire to reckon and
19 respond to our past failures as an organization," and which includes "Assess and improve the organizational climate of
20 NCA for historical disenfranchised members" as Goal 1, and "Evaluate and restructure the organization to render NCA a
21 more inclusive, diverse, equitable, and accessible organization" as Goal 5,

22
23 Whereas, as of 2022, 12 articles are the entire history of knowledge that at least partly centers Palestine within the 11
24 journals that NCA published at the time², which gives clear evidence of Palestinian members of NCA as historical
25 disenfranchised members,

26
27 Whereas, communication scholars have shown unequivocally that "dehumanization is woven through the fabric of
28 genocide"³ and long established that language is the central channel through which dehumanization occurs⁴,

29
30 Whereas, Israeli Prime Ministers have a long history of dehumanizing Palestinians^{5 6}, including Israel's first Prime
31 Minister, David Ben-Gurion saying that "We view [Palestinians] like donkeys. They don't care. They accept it with love;"
32 Israel's fourth Prime Minister Golda Meir stating that "We cannot forgive [Palestinians] for forcing us to kill their
33 children," Israel's sixth Prime Minister Menachem Begin describing Palestinians as "two footed animals;"⁷ Israel's
34 seventh Prime Minister Yitzhak Shamir asserting that "[The Palestinians] would be crushed like grasshoppers...heads
35 smashed against the boulders and walls;" Israel's 10th Prime Minister Ehud Barak stating that "The Palestinians are like
36 crocodiles, the more you give them meat, they want more," and Israel's 11th Prime Minister, Ariel Sharon, in 2002
37 directing his Chief of Staff and a troop commander this way: "If possible [Palestinians] should get awake every morning
38 finding out they get 10 or 12 corpses, without knowing what happened...You must be creative, efficient, sophisticated,"
39

40 Whereas, since Hamas' attack on Israel on October 7, 2023, the dehumanizing rhetoric from Israel's current Prime
41 Minister (Benjamin Netanyahu) has dramatically escalated and repeated across months of speeches and media
42 appearances, including describing the war as "a battle of civilization against barbarism," as a "war between the sons of
43 light and the sons of darkness," saying that "Gaza is the city of evil,"
44

45 Whereas, Israeli officials have a long history of dehumanizing Palestinians^{8 9 10}, including cabinet minister Rafael Eitan
46 saying that Palestinians "will only be able to scurry around like drugged roaches in a bottle" if his 1983 plan to multiply
47 settlements was adopted^{11 12}, Israeli President Moshe Katsav responding to the murder of two Israeli youths by
48 Palestinians in 2001 this way: "There is a huge gap between us and our enemies, not just in ability but in morality,
49 culture, sanctity of life, and conscience;" Moshe Feiglin, former Deputy Speaker of the Israeli Knesset, stating in 2014
50 that "One hair on the head of an Israeli soldier is more precious than the entire Gazan populace," and former Minister of
51 Interior and Minister of Justice Ayelet Shaked proclaiming that "It is not a war against terror, and not a war against
52 extremists, and not even a war against the Palestinian Authority....Who is the enemy? The Palestinian people."
53

54 Whereas, since Hamas' attack on Israel on October 7, 2023, the dehumanizing rhetoric from Israeli officials has
55 dramatically increased^{13 14}, including Defense Minister Yoav Gallant calling Palestinians "human animals," (a phrase
56 having a long history, as noted, and repeated by multiple Israeli officials since October 7th, 2023) then continuing by
57 stating that "We are fighting animals and are acting accordingly." A member of the Knesset (Revital Tali Gottlieb),
58 repeated a claim made by the President of Israel (Isaac Herzog) that "there are no innocents in Gaza," but pushing it
59 further: "There are no uninvolved, neither in Khan Yunis nor in Saja'iyah. They are all deserving of death;" Deputy Speaker
60 of the Knesset (Nissim Vaturi) continuing the theme, arguing that "there are no innocents" in Gaza" and also asked
61 "Who's left in Gaza? Are there citizens?" following by suggesting that "There are only tunnels, Hamas, and accursed
62 terrorists who murdered children and are holding children hostage;" Israel's Finance Minister (Bezalel Yoel Smotrich)
63 activating the memory of the Holocaust by suggesting that "there are 2 million Nazis in Gaza;" former Israeli
64 Ambassador to the United Nations Dan Gilbert saying in an interview: "I am very puzzled by the constant concern which
65 the world is showing for the Palestinian people," then calling the Palestinian people "inhuman animals" and comparing
66 them to the Taliban ("I don't remember people shedding tears for the Taliban")¹⁵; and a member of the Knesset (Merav
67 Ben-Ari) contrasting Palestinian children with Israeli people this way: "The children in Gaza have brought this upon
68 themselves. We are a people who live in peace, a people who seek life."

70 Whereas, both Israeli officials and President Biden have repeatedly made false claims that contribute to the
71 dehumanization of Palestinians, including repeated reference to Hamas' beheading of babies on October 7, 2023, a
72 claim proven to be false¹⁶.

74 Whereas, dehumanization is widely recognized as the fourth stage of the 10 stages of genocide¹⁷, and the Montreal
75 Holocaust Museum recommends "promptly denounc[ing] and punish[ing]" users of dehumanizing language as a form of
76 genocide prevention¹⁸,

78 Whereas, the United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (UNCERD) released a statement less
79 than 20 days into Israel's war on Gaza [October 27, 2023], in which they express being "highly concerned about the
80 sharp increase in racist hate speech and dehumanization directed at Palestinians since 7 October, particularly on the
81 Internet and in social media, including by senior officials, politicians, members of the Parliament, and public figures,
82 particularly the statement of 9 October made by the Israeli Minister of Defense, Yoav Gallant, in which he referred to
83 Palestinians as 'human animals', language which could incite genocidal actions."¹⁹

85 Whereas the dehumanizing rhetoric has reached such lengths that a recent poll by the Israeli Institute for National
86 Security Studies revealed that the majority of the Israeli public is against the prosecution of an Israeli soldier for the
87 sexual assault and murder of a Palestinian detainee²⁰,

89 Whereas, Israel has committed the following atrocities against Palestinians since October 7, 2023 (as of May 24, 2024)²¹:
90 the killing of at least 41,455 people, including more than 16,500 children, the injury of more than 95,878 people, with
91 more than 10,000 missing (presumed to be killed under rubble) in Gaza, and the killing of at least 716 people, including
92 160 children, and the injury of more than 5,700 Palestinians in the West Bank.

94 Whereas, the United Nations has shown that between October 8 and October 21, 2023, among other periods since,
95 Israel closed off all entries to Gaza, preventing all food, goods, humanitarian aid, medicine, and other basic needs from
96 entering, and shut off all electricity, water, and gas.²²

98 Whereas, Israel has inflicted forced starvation upon the population in Gaza, with a report released on March 18, 2024 by
99 the Integrated Food Security Phase Classification (IPC)²³ finding that "starvation is imminent for 1.1 million people in
100 Gaza" and there is not a single person in Gaza classified as having food security. A June, 2024 update concludes that
101 "about 96 percent of the population in the Gaza Strip (2.15M people) face high levels of acute food insecurity" and that
102 "the whole territory is classified in Emergency (IPC Phase 4)" with nearly 500,000 people (22% of the population) "facing
103 catastrophic levels of acute food insecurity (IPC Phase 5)," which reflects "extreme lack of food, starvation, and
104 exhaustion of coping capacities"²⁴

106 Whereas, the United States bears some responsibility over the atrocities committed by Israel as a result of over \$200
107 billion in military aid to Israel since its inception, with the Biden administration sending more than 100 arms shipments
108 to Israel and requesting \$14 billion in additional military aid since October 7, 2023^{25 26}, along with the repeated use of its
109 veto power to stop UN calls for either humanitarian aid corridors or a ceasefire in Gaza²⁷,

110
111 Whereas, the US Center for Constitutional Rights in 2016 described Israel's decades long violence against the Palestinian
112 people as a genocide²⁸ and on October 18, 2023 released an emergency legal briefing that situated what they described
113 as an "unfolding genocide" in Gaza²⁹, and has joined 138 non-governmental organizations, including Jewish
114 organizations, in filing a lawsuit against the Biden administration for their failure to prevent, and thus their complicity in,
115 genocide³⁰,

116
117 Whereas, on December 29, 2023, South Africa brought claims against Israel to the International Court of Justice (ICJ)
118 alleging violations by Israel of its obligations under the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of
119 Genocide (the Genocide Convention).

120
121 Whereas, the ICJ, in their preliminary report (released January 26, 2024), concluded that it was "plausible" that Israel
122 was committing acts of genocide and ordered several provisional measures with which Israel must comply prior to the
123 court's final decision about the appeal³¹, almost all of which it has failed to do³².

124
125 Whereas, on March 25, 2024, a report from the *United Nations Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in*
126 *the Palestinian territories occupied since 1967* concluded that "there are reasonable grounds to believe that the
127 threshold indicating Israel's commission of genocide is met."³³

128
129 Whereas, the UNRWA Commissioner-General has argued that Israel's devastation of Gaza is "compounded by
130 dehumanizing language,"³⁴

131
132 Whereas, scholars have argued that "censorship is a crucial complement of genocide,"³⁵

133
134 Whereas, there are multiple reports of an "unprecedented surge in anti-Palestinian repression" in the United States and
135 throughout the world since October 7, 2023,^{36 37}

136
137 Whereas, criticism of Israel as a state actor is not the same as antisemitism,³⁸ despite this, political actors around the
world are using this false conflation in a manner that undermines free speech,³⁹

138
139 Whereas, Zionism is a political project which is approximately 150 years old,^{40 41} while Judaism is the world's first
Abrahamic monotheistic religion that is approximately 4,000 years old and is centered on justice⁴²,

140
141 Whereas, the conflation of Zionism and Judaism and the assertion that all criticism of Israel is antisemitic are both
142 communication tactics used to silence Jews and other critics of Israel to prevent and delegitimize their speech^{43 44 45},
143 and over 40 Jewish groups across the world have expressed opposition to this problematic conflation,⁴⁶ and Jewish
144 members of NCA have reported it being used to question their religious identity and silence them,

145
146 Whereas, members of NCA have long experienced intimidation, censorship, harassment, and/or silencing for their
147 Palestine-centered speech, with accounts of such experiences dramatically increasing since October 7,

148
149 Whereas, the NCA 2023 convention was a site of Palestine censorship⁴⁷ in that Dr. Ahlam Muhtaseb, a prominent
150 Palestinian Communication scholar who was receiving a Presidential Citation for her impact on the field, was not
151 allowed to give her Palestine-focused short discipline visioning, as part of the convention's Presidential Address⁴⁸,
152 ostensibly because of the belief that her reference to the genocide in Gaza and the call to "Free Palestine" would do
153 "irreparable harm" to NCA^{49 50},

154
155 Whereas, NCA is neither "supporting and empowering" its members in shared struggle with Palestine, nor "reckoning
156 and responding to its past failures", nor "improving its climate for historical disenfranchised members" without a

157 resolution that (a) acknowledges the historical role of dehumanizing language and its impact on the ongoing genocide of
158 Palestinian people, (b) denounces false connotations through communicative acts that are intended to silence criticisms of
159 the settler colonial project that is Israel, (c) supports members experiencing censorship or other threats to academic
160 freedom as a result of their Palestine advocacy, and (d) commits to actions that lift Palestinian members and those
161 members engaged in joint shared struggle and advocacy.

162
163 Let it be resolved that NCA:

- 164 1. Denounces all forms of racism, bias, bigotry, and discrimination, including anti-Palestinian racism, as well as
165 Islamophobia, antisemitism, anti-Blackness, among others;
- 166 2. Denounces the dehumanizing rhetoric against Palestinians;
- 167 3. Denounces the communicative practices of falsely conflating Zionism with Judaism, unfairly framing all criticism
168 of Israel as antisemitic, and other tactics used to silence legitimate criticisms of political communication and
169 processes;
- 170 4. Supports the UNCERD call for Israel to “rescind its blockade policy and urgently allow and facilitate the
171 rebuilding of homes and civilian infrastructures; ensure access to necessary urgent humanitarian assistance; and
172 also ensure the right to freedom of movement, housing, education, health care, water and sanitation, in
173 compliance with the [International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, to which
174 Israel has been a party since 1979]”⁵¹;
- 175 5. Calls for a permanent ceasefire, and the release of all Palestinian political prisoners and Palestinians in military
176 detention, along with the remaining Israeli hostages;
- 177 6. Engages in a restorative justice process, led by professionals trained in related practices, with (willing)
178 Palestinian communication scholars negatively impacted by the censorship that occurred at the 2023 convention
179 Presidential address;
- 180 7. Affirms its commitment to advocating for the protection of free speech by denouncing efforts to silence
181 Palestinian advocacy, whether that be in NCA spaces, on college campuses, in K-12 institutions, or in any
182 organization in the United States or elsewhere;
- 183 8. Directs the Research Council to develop a proposal (for consideration through the standard proposal process)
184 that creates an NCA-funded Request for Proposals that supports research on dehumanizing language and its
185 effects, with some portion set aside to fund proposals that focus on the dehumanization of Palestinians and its
186 impacts;
- 187 9. Commits to creating space across NCA outlets (podcasts, publications, convention) that engage the question of
188 Palestine, lifts Palestinian voices, and that speak to the shared struggles for liberation across communities.

189
190 Be it further resolved that NCA publishes on the primary landing page of its website an annual update that addresses
191 progress on these commitments, starting January 2025 until January 2030.

192 Be it further resolved that a copy of this resolution be sent by email to all NCA members, be posted on NCA’s website,
193 and be sent to the President of the United States of America, the Western States Communication Association Executive
194 Committee, the Southern States Communication Association Administrative Committee, the Central States
195 Communication Association Executive Committee, the Eastern States Communication Association Board Officers, and
196 the International Communication Association Executive Committee.

¹ National Communication Association. (2021). *NCA IDEA Strategic Plan Version 2*.

https://www.natcom.org/sites/default/files/NCA_IDEA_StrategicPlan_V2.pdf

² Ghabra, H. S. & Afifi, W.A. (2022) Introduction: Writing Occupied Palestine: Toward a field of Palestinian Communication and Cultural Studies, *Journal of International and Intercultural Communication*, 15(4), pp. 355-359. [10.1080/17513057.2022.2126514](https://doi.org/10.1080/17513057.2022.2126514)

³ Haslam N. (2019). The many roles of dehumanization in genocide. In Newman L. S. (Ed.), *Confronting humanity at its worst: Social psychological perspectives on genocide* (pp. 199–139). Oxford University Press. (p. 133)

⁴ Donohue, W. A. (2012). The identity trap: The language of genocide. *Journal of Language and Social Psychology*, 31(1), pp. 13-29. [10.1177/0261927X11425033](https://doi.org/10.1177/0261927X11425033)

⁵ Hanley, D. C. (2018). Leaders who dehumanize cross the threshold. *Washington Report on Middle East Affairs*, pp. 33-34, 48.

<https://www.wrmea.org/2018-october/leaders-who-dehumanize-cross-the-threshold.html>

⁶ Baroud, R. (2023, October 24). 'Human animals': The sordid language behind Israel's genocide in Gaza. *Jordan Times*.

<https://jordantimes.com/opinion/ramzy-baroud/%E2%80%98human-animals%E2%80%99-sordid-language-behind-israels-genocide-gaza>

⁷ Hollander, R. (2004, October 4). Exposing False Zionist Quotes II (Quote Busters II). *CAMERA*.

<https://www.camera.org/article/exposing-false-zionist-quotes-ii-quote-busters-ii/>

⁸ Hanley, D. C. (2018). Leaders who dehumanize cross the threshold. *Washington Report on Middle East Affairs*, 33-34, 48.

<https://www.wrmea.org/2018-october/leaders-who-dehumanize-cross-the-threshold.html>

⁹ American-Arab Anti-Discrimination Committee (ADC). (n.d.). *Racist Incitement by Israeli Leaders Must End*. <https://adc.org/racist-incitement-by-israeli-leaders-must-end/>

¹⁰ Hollander, R. (2004, October 4). Exposing False Zionist Quotes II (Quote Busters II). *CAMERA*.

<https://www.camera.org/article/exposing-false-zionist-quotes-ii-quote-busters-ii/>

¹¹ American-Arab Anti-Discrimination Committee (ADC). (n.d.). *Racist Incitement by Israeli Leaders Must End*. <https://adc.org/racist-incitement-by-israeli-leaders-must-end/>

¹² Hollander, R. (2004, October 4). Exposing False Zionist Quotes II (Quote Busters II). *CAMERA*.

<https://www.camera.org/article/exposing-false-zionist-quotes-ii-quote-busters-ii/>

¹³ Landler, M. (2023, November 15). 'Erase Gaza': War Unleashes Incendiary Rhetoric in Israel. *The New York Times*.

<https://www.nytimes.com/2023/11/15/world/middleeast/israel-gaza-war-rhetoric.html>

¹⁴ Goldenberg, T. (2024, January 18). ICJ genocide case: Israeli rhetoric against Palestinians central to South Africa's case. *AP News*.

<https://apnews.com/article/israel-palestinians-south-africa-genocide-hate-speech-97a9e4a84a3a6bebeddfb80f8a030724>

¹⁵ Asif, Y. (2023, October 26). Former Israeli ambassador to UN calls Palestinians 'horrible inhuman animals'. *Al Arabiya English*.

<https://english.alarabiya.net/News/middle-east/2023/10/26/Former-Israeli-ambassador-to-UN-calls-Palestinians-horrible-inhuman-animals->

¹⁶ Scahill, J. (2023, December 14). Joe Biden Keeps Repeating False Claim He Saw Photos of Beheaded Babies. *The Intercept*.

<https://theintercept.com/2023/12/14/israel-biden-beheaded-babies-false/>

¹⁷ Stanton, G. H. (2016). Ten Stages of Genocide. *The Genocide Education Project*. https://genocideeducation.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/03/ten_stages_of_genocide.pdf

¹⁸ Montreal Holocaust Museum. (n.d.). The Ten Stages of a Genocide. *Montreal Holocaust Museum*.

<https://museeholocauste.ca/en/resources-training/ten-stages-genocide/>

¹⁹ Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination. (2023). Prevention of racial discrimination, including early warning and urgent action procedure: Decision 2. *Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights*.

https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/treatybodyexternal/Download.aspx?symbolno=INT%2FCERD%2FSWA%2F9904&Lang=en

²⁰ <https://mondoweiss.net/2024/08/65-of-israeli-jews-oppose-criminal-prosecution-for-soldiers-suspected-of-raping-palestinian-detainees/>

²¹ AJLabs. (2023, October 9). Israel-Gaza war in maps and charts: Live tracker. *Al Jazeera*. Retrieved May 24, 2024, from

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/longform/2023/10/9/israel-hamas-war-in-maps-and-charts-live-tracker>

²² United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights. (2024). Human rights situation in the Occupied Palestinian Territory, including East Jerusalem, and the obligation to ensure accountability and justice. *Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights*. <https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/2024-02/a-hrc-55-28-auv-for-publication.pdf>

²³ Integrated Food Security Phase Classification. (2024). GAZA STRIP: Famine is imminent as 1.1 million people, half of Gaza,

experience catastrophic food insecurity. *IPC*. <https://www.ipcinfo.org/ipcinfo-website/alerts-archive/issue-97/en/>

<https://www.ipcinfo.org/ipc-country-analysis/details-map/en/c/1157065/?iso3=PSE>

²⁵ Masters, J., & Mellow, W. (2024, April 11). U.S. Aid to Israel in Four Charts. *Council on Foreign Relations*.

<https://www.cfr.org/article/us-aid-israel-four-charts>

²⁶ Center for Constitutional Rights. (2024, March 15). Biden-Gaza Genocide Case: Constitutional and International Law Scholars, Ex-Diplomats, Service Members, and Intelligence Officers Back Palestinians' Appeal. *Center for Constitutional Rights*.

<https://ccrjustice.org/home/press-center/press-releases/biden-gaza-genocide-case-constitutional-and-international-law>

²⁷ Nichols, M. (2024, February 20). US casts third veto of UN action since start of Israel-Hamas war. *Reuters*.

<https://www.reuters.com/world/us-casts-third-veto-un-action-since-start-israel-hamas-war-2024-02-20/>

²⁸ Center for Constitutional Rights. (2016). The Genocide of the Palestinian People: An International Law and Human Rights Perspective. *Center for Constitutional Rights*.

<https://ccrjustice.org/sites/default/files/attach/2016/08/Background%20on%20the%20term%20genocide%20in%20Israel%20Palestine%20Context.pdf>

²⁹ Center for Constitutional Rights. (2023, October 18). Israel's Unfolding Crime of Genocide of the Palestinian People & U.S. Failure

to Prevent and Complicity in Genocide. *Center for Constitutional Rights*.

https://ccrjustice.org/sites/default/files/attach/2023/10/Israels-Unfolding-Crime_ww.pdf

³⁰ Center for Constitutional Rights. (2024, March 15). Biden-Gaza Genocide Case: Constitutional and International Law Scholars, Ex-Diplomats, Service Members, and Intelligence Officers Back Palestinians' Appeal. *Center for Constitutional Rights*.

<https://ccrjustice.org/home/press-center/press-releases/biden-gaza-genocide-case-constitutional-and-international-law>

³¹ UN Human Rights Experts. (2024, January 31). Gaza: ICJ ruling offers hope for protection of civilians enduring apocalyptic conditions, say UN experts. *Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights*. <https://www.ohchr.org/en/press-releases/2024/01/gaza-icj-ruling-offers-hope-protection-civilians-enduring-apocalyptic>

³² International Commission of Jurists. (2024, February 20). Gaza: One month on, Israel fails to comply with the order of the International Court of Justice. *International Commission of Jurists*. <https://www.icj.org/gaza-one-month-on-israel-fails-to-comply-with-the-order-of-the-international-court-of-justice/>

³³ Albanese, F. (2024, March 25). Anatomy of a Genocide: Report of the Special Rapporteur on the situation of human rights in the Palestinian territories occupied since 1967. *Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights*. p. 1.

<https://www.ohchr.org/sites/default/files/documents/hrbodies/hrcouncil/sessions-regular/session55/advance-versions/a-hrc-55-73-auv.pdf>

³⁴ UNRWA, "The Gaza Strip: 100 days of death, destruction and displacement", Statement by Philippe Lazzarini, Commissioner-General of UNRWA, 13 Jan. 2024

³⁵ Sen, S. (2024, March 20). Censorship is a crucial complement of genocide. *Al Jazeera*.

<https://www.aljazeera.com/opinions/2024/3/20/censorship-is-a-crucial-complement-of-genocide>

³⁶ Palestine Legal. (2024, February 13). Media Roundup: Palestine Legal on unprecedented surge in anti-Palestinian repression since October 7th. *Palestine Legal*. <https://palestinelegal.org/news/media-roundup-since-oct-7>

³⁷ Jewish Voice for Peace. (2023, November 13). As repression grows, so does solidarity. *The Wire*.

<https://www.jewishvoiceforpeace.org/2023/11/13/repression-and-solidarity/>

³⁸ World Jewish Congress. (2024). Misconception #5: IHRA conflates criticism of Israel with antisemitism. *World Jewish Congress*.

<https://www.worldjewishcongress.org/en/ihra-misconceptions/Misconception-IHRA-conflates-criticism-of-Israel-with-antisemitism>

³⁹ Al Jazeera News. (2024, May 1). US House passes controversial bill that expands definition of anti-Semitism. *Al Jazeera*.

<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2024/5/1/us-house-passes-controversial-bill-that-expands-definition-of-anti-semitism>

⁴⁰ Hertzberg, A. (1997). *The Zionist Idea: A Historical Analysis and Reader*. Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society.

⁴¹ Seikaly, S. (2020). The history of Israel/Palestine. In O. El Shakry (ed.), *Understanding and Teaching the Modern Middle East* (pp. 101-116). University of Wisconsin Press.

⁴² de Lange, N. (2000). *An Introduction to Judaism*. Cambridge University Press.

⁴³ Palestine Legal & Center for Constitutional Rights. (2015). The Palestine Exception: A Movement Under Attack in the US. *Palestine Legal*. <https://palestinelegal.org/the-palestine-exception>

⁴⁴ Palestine Legal. (n.d.). Distorted Definition: Silencing Advocacy for Palestinian Rights. *Palestine Legal*.

<https://palestinelegal.org/distorted-definition>

⁴⁵ Jewish Voice for Peace. (2017). *On Antisemitism: Solidarity and the Struggle for Justice*. Haymarket Books.

<https://www.haymarketbooks.org/books/1065-on-antisemitism>

⁴⁶ Jewish Voice for Peace. (2018, July 17). First-ever: 40+ Jewish groups worldwide oppose equating antisemitism with criticism of Israel. *Jewish Voice for Peace*. <https://www.jewishvoiceforpeace.org/2018/07/17/first-ever-40-jewish-groups-worldwide-oppose-equating-antisemitism-with-criticism-of-israel/>

⁴⁷ Editors' Collective. (2023). On the censoring of Dr. Ahlam Muhtaseb. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*. 110(1), 1-2.

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/00335630.2023.2296710>

⁴⁸ Quinn, R. (2023, November 21). Gaza speech allegedly blocked by NCA. *Inside Higher Ed*.

<https://www.insidehighered.com/news/faculty-issues/academic-freedom/2023/11/21/gaza-speech-allegedly-blocked-nca>

⁴⁹ Muhtaseb, A. (2023). An accounting from Dr. Ahlam Muhtaseb. *Quarterly Journal of Speech*. 110(1), 3-6.

<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/00335630.2023.2296711>

⁵⁰ National Communication Association Executive Committee. (2024, March 7). Statement From The National Communication Association Executive Committee. *National Communication Association*. <https://www.natcom.org/press-room/statement-national-communication-association-executive-committee>

⁵¹ Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination. (2023). Israel and the State of Palestine: Statement 5. *Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights*.

https://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/15/TreatyBodyExternal/DownloadDraft.aspx?key=6xB5VA8bX7dpmO6n1InwY2Alk9JI7Y3M2BOW7bF4xdaLcNCEEGmf/BeCqA52axvhoqUA6j4NbmKQI7erG/ykDg==